

Effectiveness Matters!

John Wills Lloyd, Ph.D.

University of Virginia Division for Learning Disabilities

- I. What is Education's Most Important Goal?
 - A. Increasing what students know and what they can do should be the focus of education.
 - 1. Declarative Knowledge
 - a. ABCs
 - b. Historic facts
 - c. Scientific principles
 - 2. Procedural Knowledge
 - a. Sounding out English words
 - b. Solving equations
 - c. Interacting socially
 - d. Conducting electrophoresis experiments
 - B. Things that Matter a Lot Less
 - 1. What methods make teachers feel good.
 - 2. What students say they like doing.
 - 3. What education costs.
 - C. Many Factors Affect Outcomes
 - 1. Biology
 - 2. Home & community
 - 3. Schooling
 - 4. Educators Can Only Influence Schooling
 - D. Schooling Includes Many Factors
 - 1. Administrative arrangements
 - 2. Budgets
 - 3. Instruction
 - E. Effective Instruction is the Most Important
- II. How do Educators Know What is Effective?
 - A. Students' Outcomes are Measured Directly.
 - 1. Not examples
 - a. Report-card grades
 - b. Anecdotal notes
 - c. Students' opinions
 - 2. Examples
 - a. Words read correctly
 - b. Vocabulary items matched correctly
 - c. Equations solved correctly

B. Methods are Studied Experimentally.

1. Not examples
 - a. Case studies
 - b. Correlation studies
 - c. Descriptions of development
2. Examples
 - a. Group-contrast experiments
 - b. Single-subject experiments

C. Results are Found Repeatedly.

1. One or two studies is not enough
2. Replicated evidence is needed

III. What Have Researchers Learned?

A. Process-Product Studies Show General Model

1. Rosenshine's principles 1
2. Rosenshine's principles 2

B. Meta-analyses Compare Methods

1. Some not effective methods
 - a. Learning styles
 - b. Place affecting self-concept
2. Some effective methods
 - a. Cognitive-behavior Modification
 - b. Formative Evaluation
 - c. Direct Instruction
 - d. Mnemonic Strategy Training

C. Convergent Evidence Supports Complete Teaching

IV. What is Complete Teaching?

A. Basic Features

1. Systematic
2. Explicit
3. Integrated

B. Effective Curricula

1. Field tested before publication
2. Studied in experiments

C. Faithful Implementation

1. Learn how from good coaches
2. Practice, practice, practice
3. Later, add your twists and wiggles

D. Base Decisions about Progress on Data

1. Collect progress monitoring data
2. Change teaching as needed

V. Is Teaching Well Worth It?

Selected References & Resources

The following sources include many that I mentioned and others that are relevant to the topic of helping teachers learn about effective teaching procedures. In addition, via the Internet resources shown in the accompanying box, I provide other content about the case for, the basis of, and contemporary commentary about effective teaching practices. I hope you find them useful. Interested parties may use the comments features of many of the Internet resources to learn more or, of course, contact me directly at JohnL@Virginia.edu.

Selected Relevant Internet Resources

- <http://TeachEffectively.com/>
- <http://TeachingLD.org/>
- <http://LDBlog.com/>
- <http://EBDBlog.com/>
- <http://BehaviorMod.info/>
- <http://special.edschool.virginia.edu/information/mega/>

- Bateman, B. D., & Herr, C. M. (2005). *Writing measurable IEP goals and objectives*. Somewhere, WS: Attainment Press.
- Baumeister, R. F., Campbell, J. D., Krueger, J. I., & Vohs, K. D. (2003). Does high self-esteem cause better performance, interpersonal success, happiness, or healthier lifestyles [Electronic version]? *Psychological Science in the Public Interest*, 49(1), 1-44.
- Burke, M. D., Hagan-Burke, S., & Sugai, G. (2003). The efficacy of function-based interventions for students with learning disabilities who exhibit escape-maintained problem behaviors: Preliminary results from a single-case experiment. *Learning Disability Quarterly*, 26, 15-27.
- Campbell, D., & Stanley, J. (1963). *Experimental and quasi-experimental designs for research*. Boston: Houghton Mifflin.
- Carlberg, C., & Kavale, K. A. (1980). The efficacy of special versus regular class placement for exceptional children: A meta-analysis. *Journal of Special Education*, 14, 296-309.
- Carnine, D. W. (1997) Bridging the research-to-practice gap. In J. W. Lloyd, & E. J. Kameenui (Eds.) *Issues in educating students with disabilities. LEA's series on special education and disability*, (pp. 363-373). Mahwah, NJ: Erlbaum.
- Casto, G., & Mastropieri, M. A. (1986). The efficacy of early intervention programs: A meta-analysis. *Exceptional Children*, 52, 417-424.
- Chambless, D. L., & Ollendick, T. H. (2001). Empirically supported psychological interventions: Controversies and evidence. *Annual Review of Psychology*, 52, 685-716.
- Cook, S. B., Scruggs, T. E., Mastropieri, M. A., & Casto, G. C. (1986). Handicapped students as tutors. *Journal of Special Education*, 19, 483-492.
- Cooper, H., & Hedges, L. V. (Eds.), (1994). *The handbook of research synthesis*. New York: Russell Sage Foundation.

- Dunn, R., Griggs, S. A., Olson, J., Beasley, M., & Gorman, B. S. (1995). A meta-analytic validation of the Dunn and Dunn model of learning-style preferences. *Journal of Educational Research, 88*, 353-362.
- DuPaul, G. J., & Eckert, T. L. (1997). The effects of school-based interventions for children with attention deficit hyperactivity disorder: A meta-analysis. *School Psychology Review, 26*, 5-27.
- Forness, S. R., & Kavale, K. A. (1993). Strategies to improve basic learning and memory deficits in mental retardation: A meta-analysis of experimental studies. *Education and Training in Mental Retardation, 28*, 99-110.
- Forness, S. R., & Kavale, K. A. (1996). Treating social skill deficits in children with learning disabilities: A meta-analysis of the research. *Learning Disability Quarterly, 19*, 2-13.
- Forness, S. R., Kavale, K. A., Blum, I. M., & Lloyd, J. W. (1997). What works in special education and related services: Using meta-analysis to guide practice. *Teaching Exceptional Children, 29*(6), 4-9.
- Forness, S. R., Kavale, K. A., Blum, I. M., & Lloyd, J. W. (1997). What works in special education and related services: Using meta-analysis to guide practice. *Teaching Exceptional Children, 29*, 4-9.
- Fuchs, L. A., & Fuchs, D. (1986). Effects of systematic formative evaluation: A meta-analysis. *Exceptional Children, 53*, 199-208.
- Fuchs, L. A., & Fuchs, D. (1986). Effects of systematic formative evaluation: A meta-analysis. *Exceptional Children, 53*, 199-208.
- Gersten, R., Baker, S., Lloyd, J. W. (2000). Designing high-quality research in special education: Group experimental design. *Journal of Special Education, 34*, 2-18.
- Gersten, R., Darch, C., Davis, G., & George, N. (1991). Apprenticeship and intensive training of consulting teachers: A naturalistic study. *Exceptional Children, 57*, 226-236.
- Glass, G. V. (1976). Primary, secondary, and meta-analysis. *Educational Researcher, 5*, 3-8.
- Glass, G. V., & Smith, M. L. (1979). Meta-analysis of research on class size and achievement. *Educational Evaluation and Policy Analysis, 1*, 2-16.
- Glass, G. V., McGaw, B., & Smith, M. L. (1978). *Meta-analysis in social research*. Beverly Hills, CA: Sage.
- Graham, S., & Perrin, D. (2007). A meta-analysis of writing instruction for adolescent students. *Journal of Educational Psychology, 99*, 445-476.
- Hattie, J. (2009). *Visible learning: A synthesis of over 800 meta-analyses relating to achievement*. New York: Routledge.
- Heubusch, J. D., & Lloyd, J. W. (1998). Effects of correction procedures on oral reading. *Journal of Behavioral Education, 8*, 63-79.
- Jenkins, J. R., Antil, L. R., Wayne, S. K., & Vadasy, P. F. (2003). How cooperative learning works for special education and remedial students. *Exceptional Children, 69*, 279-292.
- Justice, L. M., & Pullen, P. C. (2003). Promising interventions for promoting emergent literacy: Three evidence-based interventions. *Topics in Early Childhood Special Education, 23*, 99-113.
- Kamps, D. M., Wills, H. P., Greenwood, C. R., Thorne, S., Lazo, J. F., Crockett, J. L., Akers, J. M., & Swaggart, B. L. (2003). Curriculum influences on growth in early reading fluency for

- students with academic and behavioral risks: A descriptive study. *Journal of Emotional & Behavioral Disorders*, 11, 211-224.
- Kauffman, J. M., & Lloyd, J. W. (in press). Statistics, data, and special educational decisions: Basic links to realities. In J. M. Kauffman & D. P. Hallahan (Eds.), *Handbook of special education*. New York: Routledge.
- Kavale, K. A. (1981). Functions of the Illinois test of Psycholinguistic Abilities (ITPA): Are they trainable? *Exceptional Children*, 47, 496-510.
- Kavale, K. A. (1982). The efficacy of stimulant drug treatment for hyperactivity: A meta-analysis. *Journal of Learning Disabilities*, 15, 280-289.
- Kavale, K. A., & Forness, S. R. (1983). Hyperactivity and diet treatment: A meta-analysis of the Feingold hypothesis. *Journal of Learning Disabilities*, 16, 324-330.
- Kavale, K. A., & Forness, S. R. (1987). Substance over style: A quantitative synthesis assessing the efficacy of modality testing and teaching. *Exceptional Children*, 54, 228-234.
- Kavale, K. A., & Forness, S. R. (1987). Substance over style: A quantitative synthesis assessing the efficacy of modality testing and teaching. *Exceptional Children*, 54, 228-234.
- Kavale, K. A., & Mattson, P. D. (1983). "One jumped off the balance beam": Meta-analysis of perceptual-motor training. *Journal of Learning Disabilities*, 16, 165-173.
- Kavale, K. A., & Nye, C. (1984). The effectiveness of drug treatment for severe behavioral disorders: A meta-analysis. *Behavioral Disorders*, 9, 117-130.
- Kavale, K. A., Mathur, S. R., Forness, S. R., Rutherford, R. B., Jr., & Quinn, M. M. (1997). Effectiveness of social skills training for students with behavior disorders: A meta-analysis. In T. E. Scruggs & M. A. Mastropieri (Eds.), *Advances in learning and behavioral disabilities* (Vol. 11; pp. 1-26). Greenwich, CN: JAI.
- Kozleski, E., Mainzer, R., & Deshler, D. (2000). *Bright futures for exceptional learners: An agenda to achieve quality conditions for teaching and learning*. Arlington, VA: Council for Exceptional Children.
- Lloyd, J., Epstein, M. H., & Cullinan, D. (1981). Direct teaching for learning disabilities. In J. Gottlieb & S. S. Strichart (Eds.), *Developmental theory and research in learning disabilities* (pp. 278-309). Baltimore: University Park Press.
- Lloyd, J. W., Forness, S. R., & Kavale, K. A. (1998). Some methods are more effective. *Intervention in School and Clinic*, 33(1), 195-200.
- Lloyd, J., Saltzman, N. J., & Kauffman, J. M. (1981). Predictable generalization in academic learning as a result of preskills and strategy training. *Learning Disability Quarterly*, 4, 203-216.
- Lloyd, J. W., Pullen, P. L., Tankersley, M., & Lloyd, P. A. (2006). Critical dimensions of experimental studies and research syntheses that help define effective practices. In B. G. Cook & B. R. Schirmer (Eds.), *What is special about special education: Examining the role of evidence-based practices* (pp. 136-153). Austin, TX: Pro-Ed.
- Lonigan, C., Elber, J., & Johnson, S. (1998). Empirically supported interventions for children: An overview. *Journal of Clinical Child Psychology*, 27, 138-145.
- Mann, V. A., & Foy, J. G. (2003). Speech development, phonological awareness, and letter knowledge in preschool children. *Annals of Dyslexia*, 53, 149-173.

- Mastropieri, M. A., & Scruggs, T. E. (1989). Constructing more meaningful relations: Mnemonic instruction for special populations. *Educational Psychology Review*, 1(2), 83-111.
- McCandliss, B., Beck, I. L., Sandak, R., & Perfetti, C. (2003). Focusing attention on decoding for children with poor reading skills: Design and preliminary tests of the word building intervention. *Scientific Studies in Reading*, 7, 75-104.
- Miller, K. A., Gunter, P. A., Venn, M. L., Hummel, J., & Wiley, L. P. (2003). Effects of curricular and materials modification on academic performance and task engagement of three students with emotional or behavioral disorders. *Behavioral Disorders*, 28, 130-149.
- Mosteller, F., & Boruch, R. (Eds.). (2002). *Evidence matters: Randomized trials in education research*. Washington, DC: Brookings.
- National Institute of Child Health and Human Development Early Child Care Research Network. (2002). The relation of global first-grade classroom environment to structural classroom features and teacher and student behaviors. *Elementary School Journal*, 102, 367-387.
- National Research Council & Institute of Medicine. (2000). *From neurons to neighborhoods: The science of early childhood development*.
- National Research Council. (2002). *Scientific research in education*. Committee on Scientific Principles for Education Research. R. J. Shavelson & L. Towne, (Eds.). Center for Education. Division of Behavioral and Social Sciences and Education. Washington, DC: National Academy Press.
- O'Connor, R. E., Notari-Syverson, A., & Vadasy, P. (1998). First-grade effects of teacher-led phonological activities in kindergarten for children with mild disabilities: A follow-up study. *Learning Disabilities Research & Practice*, 13, 43-52.
- Pullen, P. C., Lloyd, P. A., & Lloyd, J. W. (2007). Academic problems. In R. Morris & T. Kratochwill (Eds.), *Practice of child therapy* (4th. ed.; pp. 187-206). Mahwah, NJ: Erlbaum.
- Robinson, T. R., Brownell, M. T., Smith, S. W., & Miller, M. D. (1999). Cognitive-behavior modification of hyperactivity/impulsivity and aggression: A meta-analysis of school-based studies. *Journal of Educational Psychology*, 91, 195-203.
- Rosenthal, R. (1978). Combining results of independent studies. *Psychological Bulletin*, 85, 185-193.
- Schmidt, M., Weinstein, T., Niemic, R., & Walberg, H. J. (1986). Computer-assisted instruction with exceptional children. *Journal of Special Education*, 19, 493-501.
- Serna, L. A., Nielsen, E., Mattern, N., Forness, S. (2003). Primary prevention in mental health for Head Start classrooms: Partial replication with teachers as interveners. *Behavioral Disorders*, 28, 124-129.
- Serna, L., Nielsen, E., Lambros, K., & Forness, S. (2000). Primary prevention with children at risk for emotional and behavioral disorders: Data on a universal intervention for Head Start classrooms. *Behavioral Disorders*, 26, 70-84.
- Shannon, P., Grinde, L. R., & Cox, A. W. (2003). Families' perceptions of the ability to pay for early intervention services. *Journal of Early Intervention*, 25, 164-172.
- Shaywitz, B. A., Pugh, K. R., Jenner, A. R., Fulbright, R. K., Fletcher, J. M., Gore, J. C., & Shaywitz, S. E. (2000). The neurobiology of reading and reading disability (dyslexia). In M. L. Kamil, P. B. Mosenthal, P. D. Pearson, R. Barr (Eds.), *Handbook of reading research* (vol. III; pp. 229-250). Mahwah, NJ: Erlbaum.

- Skiba, R., & Casey, A. (1985). Interventions for behavior disordered students: A quantitative review and methodological critique. *Behavioral Disorders, 10*, 239-252.
- Speece, D. L., Mills, C., Ritchey, K. D., & Hillman, E. (2003). Initial evidence that letter fluency tasks are valid indicators of early reading skill. *The Journal of Special Education, 36*, 223-233.
- Stage, S. A., & Quiroz, D. R. (1997). A meta-analysis of interventions to decrease disruptive classroom behavior in public education settings. *School Psychology Review, 26*, 333-368.
- Stanovich, K. E. (2003). Understanding the styles of science in reading. *Scientific Studies of Reading, 7*, 105-126.
- Stebbins, L. B., St. Pierre, R. G. , & Proper, E. C. (1977). *Education as experimentation: A planned variation model (Volume IV-A & B) Effects of follow through models*. Cambridge, MA.: Abt Associates.
- Stoiber, K. C., & Kratochwill, T. R. (2002). Empirically supported interventions and school psychology: Rationale and methodological issues--Part I. *School Psychology Quarterly, 15*, 75-105.
- Swanson, H. L. (1988). Toward a metatheory of learning disabilities. *Journal of Learning Disabilities, 21*, 196-209.
- Swanson, H. L., O'Shaughnessy, T. E., McMahon, C. M., Hoskyn, M., & Sachse-Lee, C. M. (1998). A selective synthesis of single subject design intervention research on students with learning disabilities. In T. E. Scruggs & M. A. Mastropieri (Eds), *Advances in learning and behavioral disabilities* (Vol. 12; pp. 79-126). Greenwich, CT: JAI.
- Talbott, E., Lloyd, J. W., & Tankersley, M. (1994). Effects of reading comprehension interventions for students with learning disabilities. *Learning Disability Quarterly, 17*, 223-232.
- Telzrow, C. F., & Beebe, J. J. (2002). Best practices in facilitating intervention adherence and integrity. In A. Thomas & J. Grimes (Eds.), *Best practices in school psychology*, Vol. 4 (pp.503-516). Bethesda, MD: National Association of School Psychologists.
- Weiss, M. P., & Lloyd, J. W. (2001). Structure and effective teaching. In D. P. Hallahan & B. K. Keogh (Eds.), *Research and global perspectives in learning disabilities: Essays in honor of William M. Cruickshank* (pp. 131-145). Mahwah, NJ: Erlbaum.
- Weisz, J. R., Weiss, B., Alicke, M. D., & Klotz, M. L. (1987). Effectiveness of psychotherapy with children and adolescents: A meta-analysis for clinicians. *Journal of Consulting and Clinical Psychology, 55*, 542-549.
- White, W. A. T. (1988). A meta-analysis of effects of direct instruction in special education. *Education and Treatment of Children, 11*, 364-374.
- Wiener, J. & Harris, P. J. (1997). Evaluation of an individualized, context-based social skills training program for children with learning disabilities. *Learning Disabilities Research & Practice, 12*, 1997, 40-53.
- Willingham, D. T., & Lloyd, J. W. (2007). How educational theories can use neuroscientific data. *Mind, Brain, & Education, 1*, 140-149.
- Zigmond, N., & Magiera, K. (2001). A focus on co-teaching. *Current Practice Alerts, 6*, 1-4.